



**AUDIT REPORT
ON
THE ACCOUNTS OF
PUBLIC SECTOR ENTERPRISES
GOVERNMENT OF BALOCHISTAN**

AUDIT YEAR 2024-25

AUDITOR-GENERAL OF PAKISTAN

**SERVING THE NATION BY PROMOTING ACCOUNTABILITY TRANSPARENCY AND
GOOD GOVERNANCE IN THE MANAGEMENT AND USE OF PUBLIC RESOURCES**

FOR THE CITIZENS OF PAKISTAN

PREFACE

Articles 169 and 170 of Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 read with sections 8 and 15 of the Auditor-General's (Functions, Powers and Terms and Conditions of Service) Ordinance, 2001 require the Auditor-General of Pakistan to conduct audit of the accounts of Government commercial undertakings, authorities or bodies established by the federation or provinces.

This report is based on audit of the accounts of Public Sector Enterprises of Government of Balochistan for the year 2023-24. The Director General Commercial Audit and Evaluation, Karachi, conducted audit during the period July 01, 2024 to November 15, 2024 on a test check basis, with a view to report significant findings to the relevant stakeholders. The main body of the Audit Report includes systemic issues and relatively less significant issues have been listed in the Annex-1 (MFDAC). The audit observations listed in the Annex-1 shall be pursued with the relevant Principal Accounting Officers (PAOs) of the department at Departmental Accounts Committee (DAC) level. In case where the PAO do not initiate appropriate action, the audit observations shall be brought to the notice of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) through the next year's Audit Report.

There are certain audit para(s) which were also reported in last year(s) Audit Report(s) for the financial year 2022-23. Recurrence of such irregularities are matter of concern and needs to be addressed.

The Audit Report is submitted to Governor of Balochistan in pursuance of the Article 171 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 for causing it to be laid before the Provincial Assembly.

Islamabad
Dated:

(Muhammad Ajmal Gondal)
Auditor-General of Pakistan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS & ACRONYMS	vii
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ix
Chapter-1	13
Industries and Commerce Department	13
1.1 Government Printing Press, Quetta	14
1.1.1 Introduction	14
1.1.2 Comments on Audited Accounts	14
1.1.3 Compliance of PAC Directives	14
1.1.4 Audit Paras	14
1.2 Small Industries Wing, Quetta	20
1.2.1 Introduction	20
1.2.2 Comments on the Audited Accounts	20
1.2.3 Compliance of PAC Directives	21
1.2.4 Audit Paras	21
Chapter-2	27
Labour and Manpower Department	27
2.1 Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution	27
2.1.1 Introduction	27
2.1.2 Comments on the Audited Accounts	27
2.1.3 Compliance of PAC Directives	28
2.1.4 Audit Paras	28
Annex-1	55
Annex-2	56
Annex-3	57
Annex-4	59

ABBREVIATIONS & ACRONYMS

AGP	Auditor-General of Pakistan
BESSI	Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution
BPPR	Balochistan Public Procurement Rules
BPPRA	Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority
DAC	Departmental Accounts Committee
DG CA&E	Director General, Commercial Audit & Evaluation
GFR	General Financial Rule
GPP	Government Printing Press
MFDAC	Memorandum for Departmental Accounts Committee
NOC	No Objection Certificate
PAC	Public Accounts Committee
PAO	Principal Accounting Officer
PSDP	Public Sector Development Program
PSEs	Public Sector Enterprises
SIW	Small Industries Wing

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Director General Commercial Audit & Evaluation (DGCA&E) South, Karachi carried out audit & evaluation of Public Sector Enterprises (PSEs) established by Government of Balochistan which maintain their accounts on commercial basis. Section 8 & 15 of the Auditor-General's (Functions, Powers and Terms and Conditions of Service) Ordinance, 2001 empowers the Auditor-General of Pakistan to conduct audit of companies and corporations established in public sector. DG (CA&E) Karachi is mandated to conduct regularity audit (financial audit & compliance with authority audit), performance audit and special audit of these PSEs. Out of total human resources available with DG (CA&E) Karachi, 09 officers and staff (180 man-days) were deputed for the audit of Balochistan Government entities. An expenditure of Rs.1.191 million was incurred against above audits.

This report does not contain comments on the annual audited accounts of 03 public sector enterprises for the financial year 2023-24 as the concerned management failed to submit their annual audited accounts within four months of closure of financial / calendar year as mandated under regulatory requirements.

a. Scope of Audit

This office is mandated to conduct audit of 03 formations working under 02 PAOs. Total expenditure and receipt of these formations were Rs.1,272.724 million and Rs.261.367 million, respectively for the financial year 2023-24.

Audit coverage relating to expenditure and receipt comprises 03 formations of 02 PAOs having a total expenditure and receipt of Rs.1,272.724 million and Rs.261.367 million for the financial year 2023-24. The audit coverage of expenditure is Rs.127.272 million and that of receipts is Rs.26.136 million, which in terms of percentage is only 10%.

b. Recoveries at the instance of Audit

Audit pointed out recovery of Rs.84.092 million however, the management failed to recover the amount at the instance of audit during the period.

c. Audit Methodology

Planning and Permanent Files of auditee organizations maintained in the Office of DG (CA&E) were updated before undertaking audit exercise for the

year 2023-24. The desk audit helped in identifying high risk areas in operations, investment, procurements, asset & human resource management.

During field audit activities, transactions were checked on the basis of the organization's rules and regulations and government policies and directives keeping in view the international best practices. Audit also evaluated the internal control systems of the management and selected the sample on the basis of the result of the evaluation of these controls. Audit also carried out discussion with management and site.

d. Comments on Internal Controls and Internal Audit department

Internal controls are reflected from policies, procedures, rules, regulations and monitoring mechanism in any organizations. These controls not only guard against fraud, waste and inefficiency, but ensure reliable and accurate operational and financial information for rational decision-making. A number of internal control weaknesses were observed during the audit of public sector enterprises, some of them are illustrated below:

- i. Management of receivables in almost all the organizations required immediate attention. The loans to borrowers under different schemes and trade debts were not being collected timely resulting in accumulation thereof with a risk of conversion into bad debts.
- ii. Financial management needs to be strengthened by establishing a system of maintenance of accounts comprising immediate posting of financial transactions, periodical reporting within a financial year, observance of year-end procedures, timely preparation of financial statements upon close of financial year and timely audit of accounts. The Principal Accounting Officers will be in a position to control the affairs of their organizations by strengthening the financial management. The non-submission of audited accounts illustrates weakness of internal control.

e. The key audit findings of the report;

- i. Irregular procurement was reported in three cases - Rs.100.832 million¹.
- ii. Non-recovery of outstanding dues was reported in three cases - Rs.10.092 million².
- iii. Non-preparation of annual accounts in two cases³

¹Paras- 1.1.4.3, 2.1.4.7 & 2.1.4.16

²Paras- 1.1.4.4, 2.1.4.17 & 2.1.4.18

³Paras- 1.2.4.5 & 2.1.4.23

f. Recommendations

The Principal Accounting Officers need to take necessary steps to evaluate, institute and strengthen the management, budgeting and accounting controls through adopting following measures:

- i. Procurements should be made in accordance with rules.
- ii. Mechanism of recovery should be re-visited to make it practical & effective.
- iii. Management should ensure preparation of annual accounts.

Chapter-1

Industries and Commerce Department

Overview

The Industries and Commerce Department (Government of Balochistan) plays a crucial role as a facilitator in creating an enabling environment for industrial growth in the province.

Aims & Objectives

The Department of Industries is striving to establish industrial estates throughout Balochistan. To achieve this goal, industrial estates with basic infrastructure have been established, and land has been earmarked for the development of mini industrial estates in various districts. The details of the auditee are hereunder:

(Rs. in million FY 2023-24)				
Description	Total	Audited	Expenditure	Revenue/Receipts
Formations	02	02	113.346	0.803

Classified Summary of Audit Observations

Audit observations totaling an amount of Rs.193.336 million were raised, which includes recoverable amounts of Rs.2.194 million as pointed out by the Audit. A summary of the audit observations, categorized by nature, is provided below.

(Rs. in million)		
S#	Classification	Amount
1.	Non-production of record	-
2.	Reported cases of fraud, embezzlement and misappropriation	-
3	Irregularities	-
A	HR / Employees - related irregularities	-
B	Procurement related irregularities	40.332
C	Management of Accounts with Commercial Banks	-
4	Value for Money and service delivery issues	-
5	Others	153.004

1.1 Government Printing Press, Quetta

1.1.1 Introduction

The Printing and Stationery Department, Government of Balochistan, was established in July 1970. Initially, the stationery wing was responsible for procuring all types of stationery articles and supplying them to various government departments and offices. However, in 1985, the stationery wing was abolished, and the department's control was brought under the supervision of a controller. The controller is now responsible for printing essential government publications, including provincial government gazettes, annual budgets, Public Sector Development Program (PSDP) reports, provincial assembly debates and proceedings, judiciary reports, and other materials for various government departments and offices.

1.1.2 Comments on Audited Accounts

1.1.2.1 The annual audited accounts are required to be provided to the audit team for review. However, the management failed to provide the audited accounts of the organization for the years 1988-89 to 2023-24.

1.1.2.2 The audit required that the annual audited accounts for the years 1988-89 to 2023-24 be finalized, and timely submission be ensured in the future. Furthermore, responsibility for the non-submission of annual audited accounts should be fixed (**Annex-2**).

1.1.3 Compliance of PAC Directives

The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) meeting has not been convened to discuss the audit reports since 1992.

1.1.4 Audit Paras

1.1.4.1 Non-achievement of revenue targets – Rs.150.810 million

As per the decision of the management the revenue targets for the year 2023-24 were Rs.176.394 million.

Rule 10 (i) of General Financial Rules (GFR) states that every public officer is expected to exercise the same vigilance in respect expenditure incurred from public money as a person of ordinary prudence would exercise in respect of expenditure of his own money.

During audit of Government Printing Press (GPP), Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to achieve its revenue targets. The details are hereunder:

(Rs.in million)				
S#	Description	Revenue earned	Revenue Targets	Loss
1	Sale of Gazette	0.618	0.810	0.190
2	Sale of Forms	2.382	2.705	0.320
3	Sale of Service Books	0.112	0.735	0.620
4	Printing Charges	22.413	166.425	144.010
5	Others	0.022	0.173	0.150
6	Fee for renewal	0.040	3.780	3.740
7	Sale of other forms	-	0.033	0.030
8	Press Receipts	-	1.733	1.730
Total		25.587	176.394	150.810

Audit is of the view that the failure to achieve revenue targets reflected weak financial management and poor governance.

The matter was reported to the management on October 25, 2024. The management stated in its reply that the department generated revenue Rs.25.587 million against allocated budget of Rs.26.30 million for the financial year 2023-24. The reply of the management is not tenable because department failed to achieve required revenue targets of Rs.176.394 million.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may set realistic targets, enhance operational efficiency, and strengthen financial management.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 1.1.4.1 having financial impact of Rs.110.505 million. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

1.1.4.2 Irregular procurement of printing material - Rs.22.000 million

Rule 04 of the Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (BPPRA) Rules, 2014, states that while procuring goods, works, or services, procuring agencies shall ensure that procurements are conducted in a fair and transparent manner, and that the object of procurement brings value for money to the agency, and that the procurement process is efficient and economical.

During audit of Government Printing Press (GPP) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management awarded following contracts amounting to Rs.22.000 million for printing material to M/s GMD. However, several irregularities were observed, including:

(Rs.in million)			
S#	Nature of work	Amount	Observations / Irregularities
1.	Printing materials of	15.000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The required 10% performance security was not received from the contractor. • 18% sales tax, amounting to Rs.2.699 million, was not deducted from the supplier. • Despite late delivery, Penalty was not imposed on the contractor. • The contract was awarded to M/s GMD, the second-lowest bidder, instead of M/s Liaquat, the lowest bidder for two items worth Rs.1.068 million
2.		7.000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2% bid security was not obtained. • Performance Security of 10% was not received. • Total quantity of 3,780 items was required but bid received for 1,644 items of Rs.7.000 million and less procurement of 2,136 items were observed. • 18% Sales tax amounting to Rs.1.260 million was not deducted.

Audit is of the view that these irregularities indicate a lack of transparency and accountability in the procurement process, potentially leading to financial losses and undermining the principles of fair and economical procurement.

The matter was reported to the management on October 25, 2024. The management stated in its reply that the department received only 5% bid security, except performance security. The opening date was extended due to the non-availability of the Chairman of the Procurement Committee. Bid security was received. Tax deduction was made by the Accountant General Balochistan in the system-generated statement. The consignment was delivered in time. The committee decided to issue supply to M/S GMD for all items as per the lowest rate and best quality. Bids were opened on other days due to the unavailability of committee members. However, the reply of the management is not tenable because the bid validity was not extended, Rs.15 million was paid to the supplier without deducting taxes from the bills, the Rs.1.5 million 10% performance guarantee was

not received, and items were supplied on 27.05.2024 before the acceptance letter on 03.05.2024.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may ensure adherence to the Rules, and take immediate action to recover the non-deducted sales tax and impose penalties for late delivery. Additionally, the management may review and revise its procurement procedures to prevent similar irregularities in the future.

(DP Nos.43 & 44)

1.1.4.3 Procurements on splitting basis - Rs.18.332 million

Rule 12 (1) of the Balochistan Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (BPPRA) Rules, 2014, states that the procuring agencies shall not split or package a procurement plan with the intention of shortening or facilitating the procurement process and approval mechanism, unless the procuring agency is satisfied that:

(a) Block acquisition of goods, services, or works will unnecessarily hold up available resources.

During audit of Government Printing Press (GPP), Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management awarded the following contracts to various suppliers/contractors on a splitting basis to avoid the tender process.

S#	Description	Amount (Rs)
1.	Cost of other Stores	4,998,750
2.	Machinery and Equipment	3,198,661
3.	Office Buildings	3,994,322
4.	Others	1,191,945
5.	Printing and Publication	1,619,413
6.	Stationery	3,328,456
Total		18,331,547

Audit is of the view that the breakdown of contracts suggests a lack of transparency and accountability in the procurement process. This weakness in financial management may lead to inefficient use of resources, potential corruption, and undermine the integrity of the procurement process.

The matter was reported to the management on October 25, 2024. The management stated in its reply that cost of other store worth Rs.499,875 were purchased through open tender, Machinery & Equipment Rs.3,198,661 and other expenditure was made on need basis as per approval of competent authority. The reply of the management is not tenable as the procurement was made in split manner in violation of rules.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may ensure adherence to the BPPRA Rules, 2014, and follow a transparent and competitive tender process for all procurements.

1.1.4.4 Non-recovery of outstanding dues - Rs.2.194 million

Rule 26 of the General Financial Rules states that it is the duty of the departmental controlling officers to ensure that all sums due to the Government are regularly and promptly assessed, realized, and duly credited in the Public Account.

During audit of Government Printing Press (GPP) in Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management completed printing jobs for various departments, but an amount of Rs.2.194 million remained outstanding.

(Amount in Rs)					
S#	Book Title	Qty	Billed	Received	Outstanding
1	PSDP 2023-24	500	1,838,045	1,402,000	436,045
2	PSDP 2024-25	350	1,223,540	-	1,223,540
3	Development Statistics of Balochistan	100	304,500	-	304,500
4	Service & General Administration Deptt	-	230,000	-	230,000
Total			3,596,085	1,402,000	2,194,085

Audit is of the view that non-recovery may lead to accumulation of bad debts and financial losses.

The matter was reported to the management on October 25, 2024. The management stated in its reply that reminders have been issued to the concerned Government departments for early payment regarding outstanding dues. Most probably all the recoveries have made within a month. The reply of the management is not tenable because no recovery has been made.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to recover the outstanding dues and strengthens its credit management policies.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 1.1.4.10 having financial impact of Rs.4.256 million. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

1.2 Small Industries Wing, Quetta

1.2.1 Introduction

As a result of the dissolution of one unit, the President of Pakistan dissolved the West Pakistan Small Industries Corporation on July 1, 1972. The projects/centers existing in Balochistan were given under the administrative control of the Industries Department by creating a Small Industries Wing in the Directorate of Industries through a notification issued by the Governor of Balochistan, dated August 25, 1972. The wing is being supervised by a director, assisted by three deputy directors and a chief accounts officer.

The functions of the following centers/institutes/shops are being supervised by the wing:

- i. Maintenance of Small Industries Estate, Quetta.
- ii. Service Center, Quetta.
- iii. Carpet Teachers Training Institute, Quetta.
- ii. Three sales shops at Quetta and Karachi.
- iii. Thirty-five Handicrafts Development centers in different parts of the province.
- iv. Thirty-nine tailoring/cutting centers in different parts of the province.
- v. Twelve leather embroidery centers in different parts of the province.
- vi. Thirty-four carpet centers in different parts of the province.
- vii. Three Embroidery Centers at Totazai, Joda Kalat, Sarwan, and Kharan.
- viii. One Cotton and Loom Centre, Quetta.
- ix. Six cotton silk centers in different parts of the province.
- x. Six Mizri Centers in different parts of the province.
- xi. Three pottery centers.

1.2.2 Comments on the Audited Accounts

1.2.2.1 The annual audited accounts are required to be provided to audit for review each year. Contrary to this, the management failed to provide the audited accounts of the organization for the years 2015-16 to 2023-24.

1.2.2.2 Audit required that the annual audited accounts for the years 2015-16 to 2023-24 be provided immediately, and timely submission be ensured in the

future. Besides, it was also required that responsibility for the non-submission of annual audited accounts be fixed (**Annex-2**).

1.2.3 Compliance of PAC Directives

PAC meeting has not been convened since 1990.

1.2.4 Audit Paras

1.2.4.1 Wasteful expenditure on closed and loss-making centers - Rs.712.175 million

Rule 13 of the General Financial Rules (GFR) provides that every controlling officer must satisfy himself not only that adequate provision exists within the departmental organization for a systematic internal check, calculated to prevent and detect errors and irregularities in the financial proceedings of its subordinate offices, and to guard against waste and loss of public money.

During audit of Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that out of 222 centers, around 124 centers were non-functional for many years. Despite their non-functioning, the management incurred an expenditure of Rs.399.000 million on account of pay and allowances.

Furthermore, following two major units were under loss due to non-generation of revenues on which management incurred an expenditure of Rs.313.175 million as detailed below:

			Amount in Rs.
Unit Name	Revenue generated	Expenditure incurred	Excess expenditure
Tailoring and Cutting Centre	39,459	171,515,690	171,476,231
Handicrafts centres	203,193	141,902,822	141,699,629
Excess expenditure on account of sick units			313,175,860

Audit is of the view that significant wasteful expenditure on non-functional and closed centers indicated lack of effective internal controls, inefficient resource allocation, non-compliance with Rules, and insufficient monitoring and evaluation.

The matter was reported to the management on August 08, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to close or revive the non-functional centers, recover the wasteful expenditure, and implement measures to prevent such occurrences in the future, including regular monitoring and evaluation of center performance and strict adherence to rules and other relevant regulations.

(DP Nos. 04 & 07)

1.2.4.2 Non-recovery of various dues - Rs.13.552 million

Rule 38 of the General Financial Rules (GFR) provides that it is the primary responsibility of the departmental authorities to see that all revenues or other debts due to the government, which have to be brought to account, are correctly and promptly assessed, realized, and credited to the public account.

During audit of the Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that an amount of Rs.11.346 million was shown as estate receivables for more than three years from different parties on account of estate charges.

Name of Party	Description	Amount in Rs.
Technical Training Centre	Ground Rent	4,021,073
Industrial Estate Police Station		1,859,762
Chilton Ghee Mills		5,465,871
Total receivables		11,346,706

Furthermore, an amount of Rs.2.206 million was recoverable as estate receivables from different parties which comprised of ground rent, penalties in case of non-utilization of land and other charges from last many years (**Annex-4**).

Audit is of the view that non-recovery highlights weaknesses in the management's financial controls and revenue collection processes, including inadequate revenue collection, lack of effective follow-up, and non-compliance with Rules.

The matter was reported to the management on August 08, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take immediate action to recover the outstanding estate dues, strengthen revenue collection processes, and ensure compliance with the Rules. Additionally, the management may establish a robust follow-up mechanism to prevent such accumulations of receivables in the future.

(DP Nos.02 & 08)

1.2.4.3 Loss of rental income due to encroachment of properties - Rs.5.466 million

Pursuant to Directorate General of Industries (Small Industries Estate) Order No. 13/DGI/SIE/7396-7399, dated October 9, 2023, the allotment of plots A-14, A-25, B-35 to C-24, C-26, C-28 to C-32, measuring 175,574 square feet, leased to the Managing Director, Chiltan Ghee Mill (Ghee Corporation of Pakistan) for 99 years, is hereby cancelled due to non-payment of ground rent and non-utilization charges, despite serving of several notices, thus terminating the lease deed agreement dated July 29, 1980, registered with the Sub-Registrar vide serial number 212, page number 227, book number 21.

Rule 13 of GFR provides that every controlling officer must satisfy himself not only that adequate provision exists within the departmental organization for systematic internal check calculated to prevent and detect errors and irregularities in the financial proceedings for its subordinate offices and to guard against waste and loss of public money.

During the audit of Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that a plot of land, measuring 175,574 square feet and owned by SIW Quetta, had been in unauthorized possession of Chiltan Ghee Mills for four decades, resulting in a significant financial loss of Rs.5.465 million in rental income. Moreover, a shop owned by SIW Quetta, located at a prime location in Saddar, Karachi, was found to be in possession of Gwadar Industrial Estate Development Authority without any formal agreement or rent.

Audit is of the view that encroachment of property highlights a critical weakness in the management's control over state-owned land, allowing encroachment and resulting in a substantial loss of rental income. The management's failure to prevent this long-standing encroachment raises concerns about their ability to safeguard public assets and ensure revenue collection.

The matter was reported to the management on August 08, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to recover the encroached land, regularize the possession, and recover the outstanding rental income. Additionally, the management may strengthen controls over state-owned land, conduct regular inspections, and implement a robust monitoring system to prevent future encroachments and ensure timely revenue collection.

(DP Nos.01 & 03)

1.2.4.4 Non-investment of funds in profitable manner - Rs.4.000 million

GFR 11 states that each Head of Department is responsible for enforcing financial order and strict economy, and is responsible for the observance of all relevant financial rules and regulations.

During audit of Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management had been maintaining two current accounts, one for working capital and one for contingencies. An analysis of both accounts revealed that, on average, an amount of Rs.5.000 million remained idle in each account throughout the last three years. Consequently, an average amount of Rs.10.000 million remained idle, causing a loss of investment opportunity, as calculated below:

			Amount in Rs.
Year	Avg. Idle Funds	Avg. Interest Rate (%)	Investment Loss
2022	10,000,000	20	2,000,000
2023	10,000,000	20	2,000,000
Total loss due to non-utilization of funds			4,000,000
<i>The 20% interest rate was an estimated average rate of two years i.e. 2022 & 2023</i>			

Audit is of the view that the management's failure to invest idle funds raises concerns about their ability to enforce financial order and strict economy. This lack of financial prudence and ineffective cash management resulted in a substantial loss of investment opportunity.

The matter was reported to the management on August 08, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may review cash management policies and procedures to ensure that idle funds are invested in profitable ventures or interest-bearing accounts, thereby maximizing returns and minimizing losses. Additionally, the management may consider establishing a treasury management function to oversee and optimize cash management, investment, and funding activities.

1.2.4.5 Non-finalization of annual accounts

Section 233 of Companies Act, 2017, states that the company shall prepare the annual accounts within four months after closure of accounts for the specific year.

During audit of Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management did not prepare or finalize the annual accounts for the year 2023-24. In the absence of annual accounts, the financial position and viability of the entity, with regard to its revenue, expenditure, profit, and loss account, could not be assessed.

Audit is of the view that non-finalization of annual accounts prevented the assessment of the entity's financial position and viability, including its revenue, expenditure, profit, and loss account, thereby undermining transparency and accountability in financial reporting. This weakness raises concerns about the management's ability to maintain accurate and reliable financial records, and their commitment to complying with statutory requirements.

The matter was reported to the management on 08 August 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may conduct a review of financial records, develop a plan to prevent future delays, and provide training to staff on financial reporting requirements. Additionally, the management may establish clear timelines and responsibilities for preparing and finalizing annual accounts, thereby ensuring transparency and accountability in financial reporting and maintaining accurate and reliable financial records.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 1.2.4.12. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

1.2.4.6 Operational loss due to poor performance

Rule 23 of the General Financial Rules states that every Government officer should realize fully and clearly that he/she will be held personally responsible for any loss sustained by the Government through fraud, or negligence on his/her part.

During the audit of the Small Industries Wing (SIW) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to generate revenue as per their potential and sustained an accumulated operational loss of Rs.880.110 million, as detailed below:

		Amount in Rs.
Actual revenue 2023-24	Actual expenditure 2023-24	Accumulative operational loss
6,236,029	7,457,395	880,110,080

Audit is of the view that operational loss indicated poor revenue generation, inadequate cost management, and a lack of effective financial controls, undermining the financial stability of the organization and reflecting poorly on the management's accountability and transparency.

The matter was reported to the management on August 08, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to address the operational loss by implementing effective financial controls, optimizing revenue generation, and reducing expenditure.

Chapter-2

Labour and Manpower Department

2.1 Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution

2.1.1 Introduction

The Social Security Scheme was launched on March 1, 1967, under the West Pakistan Employees' Social Security Ordinance No. X of 1965, with the assistance of the International Labour Organization. Balochistan Employees' Social Security Institution (BESSI), however, came into being on July 1, 1978. BESSI is an autonomous body and is guided by such instructions on questions of policy as may be given to it from time to time by the Government. The main function of BESSI is to provide medical care and cash benefits to secured workers and their dependents in the event of sickness, maternity, employment injury, death grant, iddat, disablement gratuity, disablement pension, survivors' pension, and ex-gratia grant. The budgeted (provisional) receipts and expenditure could not be provided by the department.

(Rs. in million for FY 2023-24)				
Description	No.	Audited	Expenditure	Revenue/Receipts
Formation	01	01	-	-

2.1.2 Comments on the Audited Accounts

2.1.2.1 The annual audited accounts are required to be provided to Audit for review each year. Contrary to this, the management failed to provide the audited accounts of the organization for the years 1991-92 to 2023-24.

2.1.2.2 Audit required that the annual audited accounts of the years 1991-92 to 2023-24 be provided immediately, and timely submission be ensured in the future. Besides, the responsibility for non-submission of annual audited accounts should be fixed (**Annex-2**).

Classified Summary of Audit Observations

Audit observations of Rs.2,433.712 million were raised. This amount also includes recoverable of Rs.7.898 million as pointed out by the audit. Summary of the audit observations classified by nature is as under:

(Rs. in million)		
S#	Classification	Amount
1.	Non-production of record	-
2.	Reported cases of fraud, embezzlement and misappropriation	-
3.	Irregularities	-
A	HR / Employees related irregularities	105.912
B	Procurement related irregularities	97.500
C	Management of Accounts with Commercial Banks	375.586
4.	Value for Money and service delivery issues	37.113
5.	Others	1817.601

2.1.3 Compliance of PAC Directives

PAC meeting has not been convened to discuss the Audit Reports for the last thirty years.

2.1.4 Audit Paras

2.1.4.1 Non-preparation and non-submission of annual reports of its work and activities to Government - Rs.715.310 million

Clause 34(1) of Chapter IV of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states that the Institution shall, within six months after the closing of a financial year, submit to the Governing Body an annual report of its work and activities during that financial year. The report shall cover such matters as may be prescribed. Furthermore, the annual report, together with the audited accounts of the Institution, shall be published, and copies thereof shall be made available for sale to the public.

Clause 6(2) of Chapter II of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022 states that the Governing Body shall have the power to approve the budget estimates, the audited accounts, and the annual report of the Institution for submission to the Government in accordance with the provisions of this Act.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to prepare and submit the annual report of its work and activities performed during that financial year to the Governing Body for approval within six months after closing of the financial year, as required by the Act. Although the Governing Body eventually approved the annual report and submitted it to the Government, this delay is still a concern. Furthermore, during the last two years, the management incurred an expenditure of Rs.715.310 million. The details of the budget utilized are as follows:

Rs. in million			
Description	2022-23	2023-24	Total
BESSI Quetta (Govt.)	47.533	48.933	96.466
BESSI Quetta (Fund)	44.937	41.068	86.005
Hub Office (Govt.)	60.293	62.006	122.299
50 Bedded Hospital Hub	154.067	187.066	341.133
Hub Office (BESSI Fund)	13.267	19.025	32.292
BESSI Zones	17.643	19.472	37.115
Total	337.740	377.570	715.310

Audit is of the view that non-finalization of the annual reports raises concerns about the management's ability to adhere to statutory requirements. Furthermore, the management's expenditure of Rs.715.310 million over the last two years, without timely submission of annual reports, underscores the need for improved financial management and transparency. This weakness reflects poorly on the management's accountability and may undermine stakeholders' confidence in the institution's financial reporting.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to ensure timely preparation and submission of annual reports to the Governing Body, as required by the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022. The management may establish a timeline and responsibility for preparing and submitting the annual reports, and ensure that all necessary information is accurately and comprehensively included in the report.

2.1.4.2 Non-reconciliation of monthly contribution received from employers - Rs.587.583 million

Rule 23 of the General Financial Rules states that every Government officer should realize fully and clearly that he/she will be held personally responsible for any loss sustained by the Government through fraud, or negligence on his/her part.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management did not reconcile the amount of contribution received from employers on account of

secured workers, amounting to Rs.587.583 million, despite a considerable lapse of time. The year-wise amount of contribution received is as follows:

2021-22	2022-23	2023-24	Total (Rs. in million)
127.098	192.987	267.496	587.583

Audit is of the view that non-reconciliation of monthly contribution received from employers over a considerable period raises concerns about the institution's internal controls and financial management. The absence of timely reconciliation of contributions may lead to inaccuracies in financial reporting, potentially compromising the institution's accountability and transparency.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to reconcile the contributions received from employers, and ensure that a system is put in place for regular and timely reconciliation of such contributions in the future.

2.1.4.3 Non-maintenance of separate bank account for administrative expenses - Rs.373.425 million

Clause 29(4) of Chapter IV of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states that the Institution shall maintain separate accounts for administrative expenses and for such branches of social security and such other purposes as may be prescribed.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management was required to maintain separate bank accounts for administrative expenses, as per the BESSI Act. Contrary to this requirement, the management did not open a separate bank account for administrative expenses at Hub and, instead, operated a single bank account for both contribution income and administrative expenses, in violation of the Act. The details of expenses are given as follows:

(Rs. in million)			
Description	2022-23	2023-24	Total
50 Bedded Hospital Hub	154.067	187.066	341.133
Hub Office (BESSI Fund)	13.267	19.025	32.292
Total	167.334	206.091	373.425

Audit is of the view that operating a single bank account for both contribution income and administrative expenses raises concerns about the institution's ability to manage its finances effectively, ensure transparency, and maintain accountability.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to open a separate bank account for administrative expenses. Furthermore, the management may also conduct a thorough review of its financial procedures to ensure compliance with the Act and other relevant regulations, and take corrective measures to prevent similar non-compliances in the future.

2.1.4.4 Non-registration of workers of mines & minerals - Rs.181.624 million

Paragraph 20 of Chapter III of the Balochistan Employees Social Security Act, 2022 states that the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such time, at such rate, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to detect, notify, and register the establishments of 165 mines carrying out business in Balochistan, which employed 7,883 unskilled workers. This oversight resulted in a loss of contribution/revenue amounting to Rs.181.624 million. The details are tabulated below:

No. of Establishment	No. of workers	Minimum wage	Rate @ 6%	PM Contribution (Rs)	Total Loss (Rs)
165	7883	32,000	1,920	15,135,360	181,624,320
<i>Source: Business Recorder dated. 28.09.2023</i>					

Audit is of the view that non-registration of mine workers indicated lack of effective monitoring and enforcement mechanisms, which may lead to further losses and undermine the institution's objectives.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to identify and register all unregistered mines and establishments in Balochistan, and ensure that all eligible workers are enrolled and contributions are collected accordingly.

2.1.4.5 Inadequate healthcare facilities despite allocation of substantial budget - Rs.113.006 million

Clause 48(1) and (3) of Chapter V of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "The Institution may, with the approval of the Governing Body, establish and maintain such hospitals, dispensaries, and other facilities as it finds necessary for providing medical care in pursuance of the provisions of this Act. The Institution may enter into agreements with the Government, local authority, private body, or individual with respect to the provision of medical care to persons entitled under this Act."

Clause 47(1) of Chapter V of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022 states that medical care shall include: general practitioner care, including domiciliary visiting (a); specialist care in hospitals for in-patients and out-patients, and such specialist care as may be available outside hospitals (b); essential pharmaceutical supplies as prescribed by a medical practitioner (c); hospitalization where necessary, including cases of pregnancy and confinement (d); and pre-natal confinement and post-natal care, either by medical practitioners or by qualified midwives (e).

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management was operating two 50-bedded hospitals and one dispensary at Quetta and Hub City. Despite having a large number of doctors and paramedical staff posted at these hospitals, and a substantial budget allocated for their operations, the hospitals lacked basic facilities for secured workers and their dependents, such as ultrasound, x-ray, anesthetist, gynecologist, and essential tests. Consequently,

when secured workers or their dependents visited these hospitals, they were referred to private hospitals in Karachi and Quetta. The details of the budget allocated for hospitals and hospitalization are: Rs.62.006 million (government fund) + Rs.51.000 million (BESSI fund) = Rs.113.006 million, with hospitalization expenses amounting to Rs.46.500 million.

(Rs. in million)			
Name of Hospital	No. of employees posted	Budget (Govt. & BESSI Fund)	Hospitalization Expenses
50 Bedded Hospital Hub	75	62.006+51.00=113.006	46.500
Quetta Hospital & Dispensary	N/A	N/A	N/A

Audit is of the view that inadequate Healthcare Facilities indicated inadequate planning, inefficient utilization of resources, and a lack of effective monitoring mechanisms, ultimately compromising the quality of medical care provided to secured workers and their dependents.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to upgrade the healthcare facilities at its hospitals, including the provision of essential equipment.

2.1.4.6 Operational loss due to poor performance - Rs.80.370 million

Rule 23 of GFR states that every government officer should realize fully that he will be held responsible for any loss sustained by the government through fraud or negligence on his part.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management sustained an operational loss of Rs.80.570 million, as detailed below.

(Rs. in million)		
Description	Expenditure	Revenue
BESSI Quetta (Govt.)	48.933	72.20
BESSI Quetta (Fund)	41.068	
Hub Office (Govt.)	62.006	225.00
50 Beded Hospital Hub	187.066	
Hub Office (BESSI Fund)	19.025	
Quetta Zones	19.472	-
Total	377.57	297.2
Operational Loss (377.57 – 297.20) = Rs.80.37 million		

Audit is of the view that the significant operational loss indicates inadequate financial management, non-compliance with governance principles, lack of internal controls, and insufficient oversight.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take corrective actions to rectify the weaknesses identified, including developing and implementing a comprehensive financial management plan, strengthening internal controls, and ensuring regular monitoring and oversight to prevent such losses in the future.

2.1.4.7 Procurement of medicines without stamping of “not for sale” and shelf life - Rs.74.00 million

Rule 10 of G.F.R states that every officer is expected to exercise the same vigilance in respect of expenditure incurred from public money as a person of ordinary prudence would exercise in respect of the expenditure of his own money.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management purchased medicines from different suppliers to provide health facilities to secured workers and their dependents free of cost. However, it was noticed that the supplied medicines did not bear the label "not for sale," and upon arrival at their destination, the shelf life of the medicines was not considered. In this situation misuse/sales of medicines could not be over ruled.

Audit is of the view that weaknesses of non-mentioning of not-for-sale on medicines and non-consideration of shelf-life of medicines raise concerns about the integrity of the procurement process. This lack of due diligence, inadequate controls, and non-compliance with regulations may have compromised the quality and safety of the medicines, which could have been avoided with proper planning, oversight, and compliance with regulations.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may strengthen its procurement procedures to ensure compliance with relevant regulations and guidelines, verify the labeling and shelf life of medicines before acceptance, and establish robust internal controls to prevent such lapses in the future, thereby safeguarding public funds and ensuring the provision of quality healthcare services.

2.1.4.8 Non-preparation of stock-taking report and physical verification of medicines - Rs.74.000 million

Rule 116 of G.F.R states that it is the responsibility of the Drawing and Disbursing Officer to carry out annual physical verification of stock articles at the close of each financial year, and the result of such verification should be recorded in the stock register. A certificate to that effect should also be sent to the controlling authority in terms of Rule 80 of the Manual of Contingent Expenditure. Further, Rule 159 of GFR states that physical verification of all stores should be made at least once a year under rules prescribed by the competent authority.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the stock-taking report and physical verification for assets, stock, and store, as well as the issuance of medicine and medical supplies amounting to Rs.74.000 million, were not prepared and verified.

Audit is of the view that omissions of non-preparation of stock-taking report and physical verification of medicines indicated non-compliance with regulations, inadequate internal controls, and potential financial implications, including inaccuracies in inventory records and undetected financial losses.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take corrective actions to address these weaknesses by developing and implementing a comprehensive inventory management plan, conducting regular stock-taking and physical verification, and establishing internal controls to prevent such lapses in the future, thereby ensuring accuracy and transparency in inventory management and minimizing potential financial losses.

2.1.4.9 Hiring the services of hospital without competitive bidding - Rs.46.500 million

Rule 15(1) of the Balochistan Public Procurement Regularity Authority Act, 2014, states that procurements exceeding Rs.100,000 and up to Rs.1 million must be advertised through timely notifications on the Authority's website. Additionally, these procurement opportunities may also be advertised in print media, following the prescribed manner and format, if deemed necessary by the Procuring Agency.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institute (BESSI) Quetta for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management hired the services of M/s Hashmani Hospital, Karachi, to provide medical/health facilities to secured workers and their dependents without a competitive process, amounting to Rs.46.500 million.

Audit is of the view that lack of a competitive process raises concerns about the transparency, accountability, and fairness of the procurement process. It may have resulted in BESSI not obtaining the best value for money, potentially compromising the quality of medical services provided to secured workers and their dependents. Furthermore, this weakness may indicate a broader issue with BESSI's procurement practices, warranting a more comprehensive review to ensure compliance with relevant regulations and guidelines.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take corrective actions to strengthen its procurement practices, ensuring compliance with relevant regulations.

2.1.4.10 Irregular hospitalization and specialists' consultation extended to the dependents of secured workers - Rs.46.400 million

Section 3(1) of Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states that medical care shall be provided to a secured person and / or their dependents for any illness. However, dependents are only entitled to hospitalization and specialist consultation in emergency cases, except for wives, who are covered in cases of pregnancy and confinement.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that, the secured workers and dependents were not entitled to hospitalization and specialist's consultation, except in serious emergency conditions, and for secured workers wife, in case of pregnancy and confinement. However, contrary to the rules, the management hired the services of M/s. Hashmani Hospital, Karachi, and incurred an expenditure amounting to Rs.46.400 million on account of hospitalization and specialists' consultation for the dependents of secured workers without any serious emergency condition which was in violation of rules.

Audit is of the view that extending favor to the dependents of the secured workers raises concerns about the management's compliance with relevant regulations and unnecessary outflow of resources.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may review and rectify the irregular hospitalization and specialists' consultation extended to the dependents of secured workers, ensure adherence to the regulations, and develop and implement a comprehensive plan to strengthen internal controls, prevent similar irregularities, and ensure transparency and accountability in the utilization of public funds.

2.1.4.11 Wasteful expenditure on non-operational zones - Rs.37.113 million

Clause 20 (1) of Chapter III of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "Subject to the other provisions of this Chapter, the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such times, at the rate of six percent, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

Rule 23 of the General Financial Rules states that every Government officer should realize fully and clearly that he/she will be held personally responsible for any loss sustained by the Government through fraud, or negligence on his/her part.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management incurred an expenditure of Rs.37.113 million on account of salaries and other expenses for its five zones in different areas of Balochistan. However, the management failed to generate even a single rupee in contributions. Moreover, despite posting 43 officers to these zones since their inception, not a single unit of establishment was registered.

(Rs. in million)			
Name of Zone	2022-23	2023-24	Total
Nasirabad	6.202	6.513	6.202
Turbat	2.147	2.194	2.147
Lorlai	2.442	2.740	2.442
Gwadar	6.852	8.025	6.852
Uthal	-	-	-
Total	17.643	19.472	37.115

Audit is of the view that wasteful expenditure raises concerns about the management's stewardship of public funds, transparency, and accountability, and indicates inadequate internal controls and insufficient oversight.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary actions to address these weaknesses, ensure compliance with relevant regulations, and establish internal controls to prevent similar irregularities.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 2.1.5.3 having financial impact of Rs.73.295 million. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

2.1.4.12 Un-justified expenditure on non-functional 50-Beded hospital - Rs.27.249 million

Clause 48 (1) & (3) of Chapter V of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "The Institution may, with the approval of the Governing Body, establish and maintain such hospitals, dispensaries, and other facilities as it finds necessary for providing medical care in pursuance of the provisions of this Act. The Institution may enter into agreements with the Government, local authority, private body, or individual with respect to the provision of medical care to persons entitled under this Act."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management was required to maintain hospitals, dispensaries, and other facilities necessary for providing medical care, as stipulated in the Act. However, despite running two 50-bed hospitals at Quetta and incurring a substantial expenditure of Rs.27.249 million on account of pay and allowances, the management failed to make these hospitals functional, thereby denying registered workers and their dependents access to essential medical facilities.

Audit is of the view that the non-provision of hospital related facilities to the secured workers raises concerns about transparency and accountability.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take corrective actions to address these weaknesses, ensures compliance with regulatory requirements, and establish internal controls to prevent similar irregularities.

2.1.4.13 Non-registration and issuance of social security cards and medical history books to secured workers despite receiving contribution - Rs.29.494 million

Paragraph 20 of Chapter III of the Balochistan Employees Social Security Act, 2022 states: "The employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such time, at such rate, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

Clause 20 (1) of Chapter III of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022 states: "Subject to the other provisions of this Chapter, the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such times, at the rate of six percent, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI) for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management notified various establishments operating in Hub city and collected contributions from employers of 8,675 workers. However, the management failed to register these unskilled workers with BESSI, thereby denying them benefits under the BESSI Act. Notably, the management received a substantial amount of Rs.16.482 million as workers' contributions, calculated at Rs.1,900 per worker.

Further, it was also observed that despite employers paying contributions to the Institution on behalf of their workers, a number of 8,675 workers had not been issued Social Security Registration Cards and Medical History Books to acquire health facilities and benefits. The management attempted to address this issue by sending letters and reminders to employers, requesting particulars of workers without Social Security Cards, but the matter remains unresolved.

No. of Establishments	No. of un-registered Workers	Monthly Contribution	Total (Rs. in million)
170	8,675	1,500	13.012

Audit is of the view that management's failure to register the workers despite receiving contributions and non-issuance of social security cards and medical history books to the workers indicated a lack of transparency, accountability, and internal controls, ultimately undermining the purpose of the BESSI Act and also workers & their dependents could not avail the benefits admissible.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary corrective actions to register the unskilled workers and ensure they receive benefits under the BESSI Act and the management may take necessary action to issue the Cards and Medical History Books to the affected workers.

(DP Nos. 11 & 32)

2.1.4.14 Unjustified issuance of medicines to the workers - Rs.15.000 million

Clause 48(1) and (3) of Chapter V of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "The Institution may, with the approval of the Governing Body, establish and maintain such hospitals, dispensaries, and other facilities as it finds necessary for providing medical care in pursuance of the provisions of this Act. The Institution may enter into agreements with the Government, local authority, private body, or individual with respect to the provision of medical care to persons entitled under this Act."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institute (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that medicines amounting to Rs.15.000 million were issued without obtaining acknowledgement or signatures from the patients who received them. Furthermore, patients were receiving medicines from BESSI stores without a proper diagnosis of their illness or consideration of their medical history.

Audit is of the view that the management issued medicines to the workers without maintenance of proper record which showed weak internal controls and poor inventory management.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may establish a system for issuing medicines, ensuring that patients acknowledge receipt of medicines with their signatures and those medicines are dispensed only upon proper diagnosis and consideration of medical history.

2.1.4.15 Loss of contribution income due to delay and non- registration of establishments - Rs.9.531 million

Clause 20 (1) of Chapter III of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "Subject to the other provisions of this Chapter, the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such times, at the rate of six percent, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management registered employers/establishments with a delay, resulting in a loss of contributions to the Institution and denying workers benefits they were eligible for under the Act. The details of these delayed registrations are as follows:

S#	Name of Establishment	Take up issue for registration	Registered with BESSI	Delay (months)	No of Workers	Amount in Rs.
1	M/s Seigwerk Pakistan, Pvt. Ltd	July 2023	February 2024	8	09	108,000
2	M/s Nadeem Textile Mills	September 2022	December 2022	3	24	108,000
3	ZubaidaNazir Wire Ltd.	September 2022		3	15	67,500
4	M/s Pak Xuri Blanket Textile	July 2022		6	20	180,000
5	M/s Nasa Chemicals Pvt. Ltd	November 2022		2	23	69,000
6	M/s Universal Impex	September 2022		3	10	45,000
7	M/s Noor Fine Packages	July 2022		6	05	45,000
8	M/s China Power Hub Operating	July 2022		6	163	1,467,000
Total (Contribution Rs.1500 per worker)				37	269	2,089,500

Further, the management did not collect contributions based on the minimum wage rates prescribed by the Government of Balochistan for 17,718 registered workers in various industrial and commercial units. The details are as follows:

Number of Registered workers	Minimum wages	Rate P/M	Due Contribution Rs.	Received Contribution Rs.	Shortfall Rs.
17718	32,000	6%	34,018,560	26,577,000	7,441,560
Grand Total (2,089,500 + 7,441,560) = 9,531,060					

Audit is of the view that the management could not act promptly for registration of establishments which resulted into loss of contribution income of Rs.9.531 million. This showed weak internal controls existing within the Institution.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may streamline its registration process, ensuring timely registration of employers and establishments. Additionally, the management may take immediate action to collect contributions based on the minimum wage rates prescribed by the Government of Balochistan for all registered workers.

2.1.4.16 Procurement of medicines without competitive process - Rs.8.500 million

Rule 15(1) of the Balochistan Public Procurement Regularity Authority Act, 2014, states that procurements exceeding one hundred thousand rupees and up to one million rupees shall be advertised through timely notifications on the Authority's website. Additionally, these procurement opportunities may be advertised in print media, as prescribed in these rules, if deemed necessary by the Procuring Agency.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that contrary to established procedures, the management procured medicines worth Rs.8.500 million for the 50-bed hospital at Hub without following a competitive process.

Audit is of the view that the management made procurement of medicines in violation of above rules which showed undue favor to the suppliers. Thus, procurement of Rs.8.500 million was held irregular.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may ensure that all future procurements, including medicines, follow a transparent and competitive process, as mandated by relevant laws and regulations.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 2.1.5.4 having financial impact of Rs.34.008 million. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

2.1.4.17 Non-recovery of discounted amount from distributor - Rs.5.148 million

Rule 28 of the General Financial Rules (GFR) states: "No amount due to the Government should be left outstanding without sufficient reason; where any dues appear to be irrecoverable; the orders of the competent authority for their adjustment must be sought."

Clause (ii) of the contract agreement signed with M/s. AMD Distributor states: "The medical store shall arrange to supply medicines @ 30% discount to the Institution (BESSI)."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management was required to deduct 30% (discount rate) from the payments of M/s ADM distributor for provision of medicines. However, the management deducted only 8% of the billed amount from November 2020 to April 2021. As a result, an excess amount of Rs.5.148 million remains outstanding.

Audit is of the view that despite lapse of considerable time period amount could not be recovered. This showed poor financial management and weak internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends the management may take immediate action to recover the excess amount from the distributor, and ensure that all future payments are made in accordance with the agreed-upon terms and conditions.

2.1.4.18 Non-recovery of contribution and penalty from defaulting employers - Rs.2.750 million

Clause 20(1) of Chapter III of the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022 states: "Subject to the other provisions of this Chapter, the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such times, at the rate of six percent, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

Rule 28 of the General Financial Rules (GFR) states: "No amount due to the Government should be left outstanding without sufficient reason; where any dues appear to be irrecoverable, the orders of the competent authority for their adjustment must be sought."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the following employers failed to pay the contribution and penalty on account of secured workers, amounting to Rs.1.603 million. The details are as follows:

S#	Name of Establishment	No. of workers	Amount in Rs	
			Period	Receivables
1	ATH Tailor	2	March-June, 2024	23,040
2	FSC Inter Preted	1	Dec, 2022 to June-2024	50,310
3	Haji Nizamud Din & sons	3	Aug, 2022 to June-2024	177,930
4	Kashmir Tailor	2	Dec, 2022 to June-2024	100,620
5	Khayatul Fajar	2	June, 2022 to June-2024	127,620
6	Mubarak Food & Restaurant	10	Jan, 2023 to June-2024	480,600
7	Plaza Auto Service	3	Feb, 2024 to June-2024	43,200
8	Perfect Furniture	2	Jan, 2024 to June-2024	34,560
9	Shirakat PVC Pipe	5	July, 2023 to June-2024	15,000
10	Master Biryani	3	June, 2023 to June-2024	95,040
Total		33		1,147,920

S#	Name of Establishment	Amount in Rs.
1.	Shafi Gluco Chemi Hub	160,360
2.	Mayani Poly Packages, Hub	126,000
3.	Gatron Industries P-I	19,200
4.	Pakistan Synthetics Pvt. Ltd	9,200
5.	Dawood Engineering Pvt. Ltd	114,876
6.	Al-Tayyab Beauty Pvt. Ltd	25,818
Total		455,454
Grand Total (1,147,920 + 455,454)		1,603,374

Audit is of the view that non-recovery of contribution and penalty amounting to Rs.2.750 million thereof, indicated weak internal controls and poor recovery mechanism existing within the Institution.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may recover the outstanding amount from the defaulting employers, along with applicable penalties and interest. Additionally, the management should ensure that employers are held accountable for timely payment of contributions and penalties to prevent such defaults in the future.

2.1.4.19 Non-maintenance of separate account & non-deposit of Provident Fund into trust account - Rs.2.161 million

Section 218 states that all moneys or securities deposited by employees with a company, as per their contracts of service, shall be kept or deposited by the company within fifteen days from the date of deposit in a special account in a scheduled bank or the National Saving Schemes. Furthermore, no portion of these deposits shall be utilized by the company, except in cases of breach of contract by the employee, as provided in the contract, and after notice to the employee concerned.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to maintain a separate bank account for depositing the provident fund of employees. Although the management deducted Provident Fund (PF) from employees' salaries on a monthly basis, these deductions were not deposited into the trust account.

(Amount in Rs)				
Year	No of employees	Monthly deduction	No. of months	Amount
2023-24	65	88,470	12	1,061,640
2022-23		91,693	12	1,100,316
Total		180,163		2,161,956

Audit is of the view that the non-maintenance of separate bank account for provident fund and non-deposition of Provident Fund into separate/ trust account showed the ineffective controls over the financial affairs of the Institution.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may rectify this non-compliance by opening a separate bank account for the provident fund and depositing the deducted amounts into the trust account.

2.1.4.20 Payment of benefits to secured workers - Rs.1.738 million

The Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022, is an Act to introduce a scheme of social security for providing benefits to certain employees and their dependents in the event of sickness, maternity, employment injury, or death, and for matters ancillary thereto.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that, in compliance with the Balochistan Social Security Act 2022, the management provided benefits to secured workers and their dependents in cases of delivery, disablement, death, maternity allowance, pension, and sickness benefits. The rates of these benefits were fixed by the Department through notification, in consultation with the Institution. However, it was noticed that the benefits paid to the secured workers were very nominal. The category-wise benefits paid to the secured workers during the year 2023-24 are as follows:

S. #	Nature of Category	No. of beneficiary	Amount in Rs	
			Amount per beneficiary	Nominal payment of benefits
1.	Delivery allowance	10	3,000	30,000
2.	Disablement pensioner	352	3,768	1,326,360
3.	Disablement Gratuity	0	0	0
4.	Death Grant	0	0	0
5.	Maternity allowance	1	75,000	75,000
6.	Survivor pensioner	12	1,150	13800
7.	Sickness benefit	9	32,602	293,416
Total		384	115,520	1,738,576

It is evident that allowed benefits are very nominal ranging from Rs.1,150 to Rs.3,768 in case of survivor / disablement pension and delivery allowance.

Audit is of the view that benefits were being given to the secured workers nominally in comparison with existing inflation.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024, but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may review the benefit structure to ensure that the benefits provided to secured workers and their dependents are adequate and commensurate with the prevailing economic conditions.

2.1.4.21 Non-payment of rental charges - Rs.1.624 million

Clause 32 of Chapter IV of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022, states: "No payment to which a claimant is entitled under this Act shall be withheld pending such action."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that an agreement was signed between the management (tenant) and Gwadar Port Authority (GPA), whereby the management acquired space at the GPA Civic Center building for its zonal office at a monthly rent of Rs.135,402. Upon scrutinizing the records, it was found that an amount of Rs.1.624 million was outstanding, as detailed below:

S#	Description	Amount (Rs)
1.	Three months security deposit	406,206
2.	Three months advance rent	406,206
3.	Rental charges w.e.f. Nov. 2023 to April 2024	812,412
Total		1,624,824

Audit is the view that management hired a premise at Gwadar for a zero generating zone and also failed to pay dues of GPA which was un-justified.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may settle the outstanding liability amount of to avoid any potential penalties or legal complications.

2.1.4.22 Non-collection of contribution at minimum rate of wages of unskilled workers prescribed by Government - Rs.1.186 million

Clause 20(1) of Chapter III of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022, states: "Subject to the other provisions of this Chapter, the employer shall, in respect of every employee, whether employed by him directly or through any other person, pay to the Institution a contribution at such times, at the rate of six percent, and subject to such conditions as may be prescribed."

As per the notification of the Labor and Manpower Department, Government of Balochistan, dated September 8, 2023, the Government of Balochistan increased the minimum rate of wages for unskilled workers employed in all industrial and commercial establishments in Balochistan to Rs. 32,000, effective July 1, 2023. This increase is in pursuance of the provisions of Section 4 of the Balochistan Minimum Wages Act, 2021 (Act No. X of 2021).

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the Government of Balochistan increased the minimum rate of wages for unskilled workers employed in all industrial and commercial establishments in Balochistan to Rs. 32,000, effective July 1, 2023. However, contrary to this notification, the management collected contributions from employers based on the old rate of Rs. 25,000, instead of the increased rate of Rs.32,000. As a result, the management incurred a loss of Rs.1.186 million.

S#	Employer	No. of Workers	Minimum Wage	Contribution (Rs.)		
				Actual	Collected	Difference
1	Habib Rice Product	180	32,000	1,920	1,500	420
2	Al-Karam	075				
3	M/s Gatron	310				
Total		565	(565xRs.420x5 months) = Rs.1,186,500			

Audit is of the view that the management failed to collect the contribution as per Government instructions which showed poor recovery mechanism existing within the Institution.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may recover the amount by adjusting the contribution rates accordingly and ensuring that all future collections are made based on the revised minimum wage rate.

2.1.4.23 Non-finalization of annual accounts

Section 33 of the Balochistan Employees Social Security Act, 2022, on Finance and Audit, states that the Institution shall maintain accounts of its income and expenditure, and of its assets and liabilities, in such form and manner as may be prescribed. The accounts of the Institution shall be audited by an external auditor appointed by the Government, at such times and in such manner as may be prescribed. The external auditor shall have access to the books, accounts, and other documents of the Institution at all reasonable times and may call for such explanations and information as he may require, or examine any officer of the Institution. Furthermore, the external auditor shall forward his report to the Government, together with an audited copy of the accounts of the Institution.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, a significant observation was made: the management had failed to prepare annual accounts of the Institution since 1991-92 to date. This is a critical issue, as certification of annual accounts by external auditors is a mandatory requirement under the provisions of the Act. However, due to the absence of annual accounts, certification by external auditors has not been possible.

Audit is of the view that non-preparation of annual accounts is a clear violation of the Act and raised a question mark on the affairs of the Institution.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may take necessary action to prepare and finalize the annual accounts for a transparent and accurate picture of the Institution's financial position.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 2.1.5.10. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

2.1.4.24 Non-verification of degrees / certificates

The Establishment Division, through its letter D.O. No. 6(28)2011-DG-II, dated March 8, 2011, issued directives from the Prime Minister. These directives stated that measures should be taken to authenticate the degrees and certificates of all employees. This authentication process is to be carried out by the Secretaries of offices under their administrative control. Specifically, the verification of degrees and certificates will be the responsibility of the concerned Secretary and Head of the Department or Organization.

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management failed to verify the degrees and certificates of 126 officers and staff members from the concerned degree- and certificate-awarding institutes or universities, despite a considerable lapse of time.

Audit is of the view that non-verification of degrees / certificates of the employees / officers reflected weakness of the internal controls.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may verify the degrees and certificates of the officers and staff members from the relevant institutions for ensuring the authenticity and validity of their qualifications, and to maintain the integrity of the Institution.

Note: The issue was also reported earlier in the Audit Report(s) for Audit Year(s) 2023-24 vide para(s) number 2.1.5.12. Recurrence of same irregularity is a matter of serious concern.

2.1.4.25 Non-appointment of key positions of hospital

Clause 48(1) of Chapter V of the Balochistan Social Security Act, 2022, states: "The Institution may, with the approval of the Governing Body, establish and maintain such hospitals, dispensaries, and their facilities as it finds necessary for providing medical care in pursuance of the provisions of this Act."

During audit of Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution (BESSI), Quetta, for the year 2023-24, it was observed that the management is running a 50-bedded hospital at Hub, Industrial Area, to provide medical care to secured workers and their dependents. However, it was noticed that the hospital had been operating without filling mandatory positions for a long time. The details of these vacancies are as follows:

S#	Name of post	Govt. Budget	BESSI Fund
1	Medical Superintendent	01	-
2	Deputy Medical Superintendent	01	-
3	Gynecologist	01	-
4	Anesthesia	01	-
5	Assistant Director	-	01
6	Medical Officers	01	03
7	Social Security Officer	-	02
8	Male Nurse	-	01
9	Staff Nurse	-	01
10	O.T Tech	-	01
11	Nursing Orderly	-	01
12	X-Ray Attendant	-	01
13	Midwife	-	01
Total		05	12

Audit is of the view that non-appointment on the crucial posts was in violation of rules and affected performance of the hospital.

The matter was reported to the management on September 02, 2024 but no reply was received.

Despite requests and subsequent reminders on 25.11.2024 and 06.01.2025, DAC meeting was not convened by the PAO.

Audit recommends that the management may fill the vacant positions at the hospital for smooth operation of the hospital and provide quality medical care to the secured workers.

ANNEXES

MFDAC Paras

The Directorate General of Commercial Audit & Evaluation, Karachi on behalf of the Auditor-General of Pakistan, conducted the audit of organizations of Government of Balochistan which maintain their accounts on commercial pattern.

As a result of audit conducted during 2023-24, various types of financial irregularities and losses of public money, etc., were detected and reported to the Departments and organizations concerned. The important irregularities/ losses and malpractices pertaining to various organizations have been printed in this report, while irregularities/losses not considered worth reporting to the PAC as listed below were left for Departmental Accounts Committees. The same will be discussed with the respective Secretaries to the Departments by the Director General, Commercial Audit & Evaluation, Karachi.

S#	Subject	(Rs. in million)
Government Printing Press, Quetta		
1.	Irregular posting of chief controllers for short period - Rs.13.292 million	13.292
2.	Abnormal year-end expenditure patterns - Rs.25.497 million	25.497
3.	Loss of revenue due to issuance of NOCs - Rs.1.395 million	1.395
4.	Irregular budget demand of plant and machinery	-
5.	Non-filling of vacant posts	-
Small Industries Wing, Quetta		
6.	Provision of space without agreement and rent - Rs.0.950 million	0.950

Non-submission of Audited Accounts

Annual audited accounts of Public Sector Enterprises for the year 2023-24 were required to be submitted to the Directorate General of Commercial Audit & Evaluation, Karachi by November 30, 2024. Despite requests, the organizations (listed below) failed to submit their annual audited accounts for the year(s) indicated against each by the prescribed date. While non-submission of audited accounts needs to be explained, Audit requires efforts by concerned PAOs for immediate finalization and submission thereof:

Industries and Commerce Department	
Government Printing Press, Quetta	1988-89 to 2023-24
Small Industries Wing, Quetta	2015-16 to 2023-24
Labour and Manpower Department	
Balochistan Employees Social Security Institution	1991-92 to 2023-24

Annex-3

Non-filling of vacant posts					
S#	Name of Officers	BPS	Sanctioned	Working	Excess
1	Chief Controller	19	1	1	0
2	Controller	18	1	1	0
3	Accounts Officer	17	1	1	0
4	Admin Officer	17	1	0	1
5	Manager	17	1	0	1
6	Superintendent	17	1	0	1
7	Assistant Private Secretary	16	4	0	4
8	Computer Operator	16	3	1	2
9	Commercial Accountant	16	1	1	0
10	Manager Works	16	1	0	1
11	Assistant	16	3	0	3
12	Plate & Pasting Manager	16	1	0	1
13	Stenographer	14	5	1	4
14	Accountant	14	1	1	0
15	Senior Clerk	14	2	2	0
16	Supervisor	14	1	0	1
17	Overseer	14	1	0	1
18	SM Machine Operator	14	1	0	1
19	Assistant Computer Operator	12	9	0	9
20	Gazette Storekeeper	12	1	0	1
21	Sr. Form Store Keeper	12	1	1	0
22	Sub-Engineer	11	1	0	1
23	Accounts Clerk	11	2	1	1
24	Junior Clerk	11	5	2	3
25	Bindery Supervisor	10	1	1	0
26	General Foreman	10	1	0	1
27	Printing Machine Man	10	8	3	5
28	Printing Foreman	10	1	1	0
29	Press Mechanic	10	1	0	1
30	Plate & Pasting Foreman	10	1	0	1
31	Assistant General Foreman	9	1	1	0
32	Head Computer	9	1	1	0
33	Plate Maker	9	2	1	1
34	Senior Proof Reader	9	1	1	0
35	Electrician	8	1	0	1
36	Foreman Binding	8	1	1	0
37	Junior Computer Operator	8	2	2	0
38	Senior Bindery Machine-Man	8	4	1	3
39	Copy Paster	7	2	1	1

40	Computer Grade-I	7	2	0	2
41	Docket Clerk	7	1	0	1
42	Form Storekeeper	7	1	1	0
43	Press Storekeeper	7	1	1	0
44	Proof Reader Grade-I	7	2	0	2
45	Time Keeper	7	1	1	0
46	Assistant Gazette Storekeeper	6	1	1	0
47	Assistant Press Storekeeper	6	1	0	1
48	Assistant Form Storekeeper	6	1	0	1
49	Care Taker	6	1	0	1
50	Compositor Grade-I	6	1	1	0
51	Computer Grade-II	6	2	0	2
52	Proof Reader Grade-II	6	3	1	2
53	Assistant Printing Machine-Man	5	8	3	5
54	Assistant Docket Clerk	5	1	1	0
55	Bindery Machine-Man	5	7	5	2
56	Copositor Grade-II	5	1	0	1
57	Katib Grade-I	5	1	0	1
58	Photostat Machine Operator	5	1	0	1
59	Driver	4	2	1	1
60	Binder Grade-I	3	5	2	3
61	Binder Grade-II	2	4	0	4
62	Press Inker	2	5	3	2
63	Chowkidar	1	1	0	1
64	Gate Keeper	1	1	0	1
65	Helper Of Heidelberg Machine	1	1	0	1
66	Khalasi	1	6	6	0
67	Naib Qasid	1	6	1	5
68	Press Helper	1	7	1	6
69	Sweeper	1	2	1	1
Total		154	57	97	

Annex-4

Non-recovery from defaulters - Rs.2.206 million	
Name of Unit	Amount defaulted (Rs)
Ghaznavi Flour Mills	38,298
Adil Flour Mills	17,778
Nadeem Flour Mills	38,461
Gillani Foot Wear	507,639
Alla Wala Ice Factory	8,889
Naz Furniture	1,060
National Wheat Godown	179,166
Khud-e-dad Glass Factory	80,535
Utility Store Corporation	99,955
Ch: Aslam Tobacco Factory	17,778
Sana Malsala Chakki	29,861
Ghazi Food Factory	9,555
Ditto & Sons	57,778
Modern Ice Factory	37,483
Rehmat Flour Mills	24,987
Bolan Food Pvt. Limited	27,778
Quetta Plastic Factory	38,583
Salheen Marble	119,445
Adam Industry	13,889
Bolan Flour Mills	209,505
Mohkam Wood Work	8,889
Shafiq Food Factory	21,405
Telephone Exchange	60,116
Al-Saleem Paint Factory	9,555
Safina Cold Storage	4,578
Kharan Marble	48,973
Karan Marble-2	71,666
Ch: Abdul Aziz Tobacco Factory	120,041
Mashood Wood Work	5,734
Mashood Furniture	20,960
Al-Khair Marriage Hall	59,722
Shamrez	160,967
Adil Wheat Godown	26,667
7 Star Plastic Factory	6,710
Muhammed Aslam Food Factory	6,708
5 Star Nil Factory	6,708
Alsco Paint Factory	8,485
Total	2,206,307